

**United States District Court  
Southern District of New York**

----- x

ELSA GULINO, MAYLING RALPH, PETER WILDS,  
and NIA GREENE, on behalf of themselves and  
all others similarly situated,

*Plaintiffs,*

- against -

THE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF THE CITY SCHOOL  
DISTRICT OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK,

*Defendant.*

**NOTICE OF APPEAL**

1:96-cv-08414-KMW

----- x

Notice is hereby given that the defendant in this action appeals to the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit from the judgment of the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York (Wood, J.) entered on October 11, 2019 under Rule 54(b) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure as to plaintiff class member Iris Bonilla and titled "Judgment for Iris Bonilla" (ECF No. 2866).

Dated: New York, New York  
November 6, 2019

JAMES E. JOHNSON  
*Corporation Counsel  
of the City of New York*

By: 

Claude Platten  
Deputy Chief, Appeals Division  
100 Church Street  
New York, New York 10007  
212-356-2502  
cplatten@law.nyc.gov

To: Counsel of Record (by ECF)

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

----- x  
ELSA GULINO, MAYLING RALPH, PETER WILDS, :  
and NIA GREENE, on behalf of themselves and all others :  
similarly situated, : 96 Civ. 8414 (KMW)

Plaintiffs, :

- against - :

THE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF THE CITY SCHOOL :  
DISTRICT OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK, :

Defendant. :  
----- x

USDS SDNY  
DOCUMENT  
ELECTRONICALLY FILED  
DOC #:  
DATE FILED: 10/9/19

KMW  
~~PROPOSED~~  
JUDGMENT  
FOR  
IRIS  
BONILLA

WHEREAS, the Court certified a remedy-phase class of Plaintiffs (*See Gulino v. Bd. of Educ. of the City Sch. Dist. of the City of N.Y.*, Opinion and Order, No. 96-cv-8414, [ECF No. 386]), and Iris Bonilla ("Claimant") is a member of that class and submitted an individual demand for damages on November 1, 2018;

WHEREAS, the Court appointed a Special Master (*See* May 20, 2014 Order of Appointment, [ECF No. 435]; November 12, 2014 Second Amended Order of Appointment, [ECF No. 524]) to hear, among other things, demands for damages;

WHEREAS, the Special Master held a hearing on January 9, 2019, with respect to Ms. Bonilla's demand for damages and Defendant's objections;

WHEREAS, the Special Master made, and the Court adopted, Classwide Conclusions of Law, [ECF Nos. 999, 1008];

WHEREAS, the Board of Education of the City School District of the City of New York ("BOE") and Plaintiffs entered into, and the Court so ordered, a Stipulation of Classwide Facts & Procedures, [ECF No. 1009];

WHEREAS, the BOE and Plaintiffs entered into, and the Court so ordered, a Supplemental Stipulation Concerning Admissibility of Exhibits, which attached a Supplemental Index of Exhibits (collectively referred to as the "Classwide Exhibits") filed with the Court, [ECF No. 1837];

WHEREAS, the Special Master made Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law for Iris Bonilla, annexed hereto as Exhibit 1, that he recommended the Court adopt;

WHEREAS, the Special Master recommended, and the parties agreed with the Special Master's recommendation, that the Court certify this judgment as final and appealable pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 54(b);

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that the annexed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law for Iris Bonilla (Exhibit 1) are adopted;

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that Ms. Bonilla will have judgment against the BOE as follows:

1. Backpay in the amount of \$723,259;
2. Tax-component award in the amount of \$84,983;
3. LAST Fees in the amount of \$598;
4. ASAF account award in the amount of \$5,066;
5. Pre-judgment interest calculated to be \$60,565; and
6. Pension-related relief pursuant to the terms of the Court's Order dated December 17, 2018 (Pension Stipulation & Order, [ECF No. 1014]).

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that Ms. Bonilla will be entitled to the following non-monetary relief:

1. The BOE is ordered to amend its internal service, salary, payroll, and human resources systems as follows:
  - a. Incorporate the findings of fact contained in the "Counterfactual Pension Damages Input" section, Section II(E) of Exhibit 1;
  - b. Incorporate Ms. Bonilla's counterfactual monthly service history, as listed on Exhibit B to the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law for Iris Bonilla; and
  - c. Incorporate the findings of fact contained in the "Retroactive Seniority Adjustment" section, Section II(G) of Exhibit 1.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that the Court adopts the Special Master's recommendation that this judgment be certified as final and appealable pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 54(b) and expressly determines that there is no just reason for delay for the reasons stated in the Special Master's Report and Recommendation.

This Judgment Entry is certified and entered by the Court pursuant to Rule 54(b) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

Dated: 10/9/19

ENTERED:

Kimberly M. Wood